Submission from the Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre (IDMC) of the Norwegian Refugee Council (NRC) to the Universal Periodic Review mechanism established by the Human Rights Council in Resolution 5/1 of 18 June 2007

Internal displacement in Israel including Occupied Arab Territories

July 2008

Content

I. Internal displacement in Israel & Arab Occupied Territories
II. Internal Displacement in Israel.
III. Forced Displacement in Arab Occupied Territories
IV. Situation of Displaced Communities in Israel and Arab Occupied Territories
V. IDMC’s Recommendations

I. Internal displacement in Israel & Arab Occupied Territories

1. The Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre would like to draw the Human Rights Council’s attention to the significant situation of displacement in Israel, Occupied Arab Territories in particular in Occupied Palestinian Territory (OPT). Forced displacement in Israel and the Occupied Arab Territories has largely been neglected by the international community. This is despite the severity of the phenomena of forced displacement witnessed.

2. Internal displacement in Israel has been caused by Israeli policies towards Palestinian and Bedouin Israelis, as well as by conflict between Israel and its neighbours. Several situations of displacement are of concern within Israel:

- The situation of displaced Palestinian Israeli villagers and their resettlement wherein it is estimated that between 150,000 and 320,000 Palestinian Israelis are currently displaced in Israel.
- The situation of displaced Bedouin communities in the south and the threat of eviction they currently face. Its is estimated that 70,000 Bedouin Israelis living in unrecognised villages have suffered multiple displacement and are at risk of further displacement.
- There was temporary displacement of Jewish Israelis from northern and southern Israel during the Israel-Hezbollah conflict in mid-2006, and attacks from Gaza in mid-2007. Several thousands Jewish Israelis may have been displaced as result of attacks from Gaza.

3. In the Occupied Arab Territories, consisting of Syria’s Golan Heights and Palestinian Territory, two distinct situations of displacement exist as a result of Israeli policies of occupation:

- In OPT over 110,000 Palestinians are estimated to have been displaced since 1967 as a result of the 1967 war, as well as Israeli policies in the decades that followed. From 50,000 to 90,000 are thought to be at risk of displacement in Area C, and in East Jerusalem.
- In Golan Heights during 1967, and shortly thereafter, the majority of Syrian inhabitants were forcibly displaced. Over 430,000 Syrians are still displaced, in Syria the majority of whom are descendents of those displaced at the time of the 1967 war.
II. Internal displacement in Israel

- Principle of equality and non-discrimination
- Right to an adequate standard of living
- Right to health
- Right to education
- Right to work
- Freedom of movement, and residence
- Protection of home

4. Within Israel there are three situations of displacement: the displacement of Palestinian Israeli villagers and their resettlement, the displacement of Bedouins in the south and the threat of eviction they face, the temporary displacement of Israelis from northern and southern Israel during the Israel-Hezbollah conflict in mid-2006, and attacks from Gaza in mid-2007. In contrast to displacement as result of conflict, the displacement of Palestinian Israelis and Bedouins stems from Israeli policies which continue to discriminate against the Palestinian minority, and is causing new generations of internally displaced people.

5. Today, estimates of the number of Palestinian Israelis displaced since 1948/1949 (including the descendants of the people originally displaced) vary widely, from 150,000 to 342,000 people. Successive Israeli governments enacted a series of laws and regulations facilitating the confiscation of their land since 1948. For these communities right of restitution is denied. Though displaced Palestinians supported by local organisations have appealed to Israeli courts against land confiscations and for restitution, the process has been slow and compensation if granted has been insufficient. Many of the people displaced in 1948 and their children live, like the rest of the Arab population in Israel.

6. Palestinian Israelis, including displaced Palestinian communities, continue to face discrimination in access to resources and public services. Israel does not provide Palestinian Israelis with the same quality of education, housing, employment, and social services as Israeli Jews. Municipal budgets are lower for Palestinian Israeli urban areas and towns, Palestinian Israelis remain under-represented in planning institutions and committees, and planning schemes and permits have been restricted and in certain cases frozen for several decades. Palestinian Israelis are also consequently discriminated subject to demolitions for non-adherence to planning regulations, which places them at risk of displacement. Recently in mixed city of Jaffa nearly 3,000 Palestinian Israelis have been put at risk of displacement after receiving demolition orders. Observers have linked the situation in Jaffa to broader Israel policies to develop of Jewish towns in areas heavily populated by Palestinian Israeli citizens, such as the Galilee and the Negev.

7. Since the creation of Israel, Israeli Bedouins have also been put under pressure to leave their land in the Negev region in the south of the country. Discriminatory land and planning policies have made it virtually impossible for Bedouin to build legally where they live, and also exclude them from the state’s development plans for the region. Today, about half of the 140,000 Bedouin in the Negev live in the seven government-recognised towns. The rest live in “unrecognised villages” viewed as illegal by the government and lacking public water and electricity infrastructure as well as educational, health and welfare services.

8. Following the decision to build Jewish Israeli permanent settlements in Negev region in 2003, and subsequent adoption of Negev Development Plan 2015, Israel has intensified house demolitions, destruction of crops and the filing of eviction suits. Though eviction orders are approved by Israeli courts, human rights organisations have stressed that procedures in place violate rights to due process, and provide no form of compensation or alternative accommodation. In the absence of official recognition, homes continued to be demolished, and no services had been provided to the villages considered as illegal by the state. Israel further implements forced evictions, home demolitions, and other punitive measures disproportionately against Bedouin as compared with actions taken regarding structures owned by Jewish Israelis that do not conform to government planning law. The vast majority of Bedouin villages remain unrecognised and at risk of displacement.

9. There have been several waves of internal displacement of Jewish Israelis due to the conflict between Israel and Hezbollah in 2006, and due to rocket attacks from Gaza, particularly in 2007 and
2008 in southern Israel. Israel has responded more effectively to address the concerns of these communities displaced. The end of hostilities in 2006 led to the cautious return of over 300,000 people displaced in 2006. The Israeli government provided compensation claims for individuals and businesses as well as rehabilitation of public infrastructure and institutions that had been damaged or destroyed. The Israeli government settled some 25,000 claims by individuals and businesses who had suffered direct or indirect damage, though criticism has persisted on discriminatory application of compensation schemes against Palestinian Israelis.

10. Since Israel’s disengagement plan from Gaza and subsequent Israeli-Palestinian hostilities, Israeli Jewish communities in Negev have intermittently been affected by indiscriminate attacks by Palestinian militants. In last few years, several thousand Israeli Jews from Sderot in southern Israel, bordering Gaza, may have been displaced. The number of those displaced is unclear due to lack of a registration or monitoring body. Many have asked the Israeli government for assistance to temporarily leave and resettle elsewhere. The government has not responded to such requests which imply a relocation of population at risk, preferring instead to provide assistance and improve protection of Israeli citizens, with modest success. In 2007 the Israeli Supreme Court ordered the government to reinforce all Sderot schools to withstand attacks from Gaza. Ten months following the ruling, Sderot schools remain unprotected. For these communities, access to education and enjoyment of basic human rights have been significantly impaired, and remain at risk should hostilities resume.

III. Forced displacement in Occupied Arab Territories (Occupied Palestinian Territory & Golan Heights)

11. In the OPT and Golan Heights, Israeli policies of occupation are the main source of displacement. Israel remains the primary perpetrator of arbitrary displacement in contravention of international humanitarian law and human rights law. Though there are instances in which internal displacement is the direct result of violence stemming from incursions and human rights violations, IDMC believes that the patterns of forced displacement attest to a policy of forced displacement with the purpose of acquiring land, redefining demographic boundaries, and divesting Palestinians and Syrians of ownership rights under international law. In the OPT displacement and the appropriation of land is redefining the demographic borders of the OPT and undermining hopes for a two-state solution.

12. In Golan Heights, the majority of Syrians were forcibly displaced in or just after the 1967 war. Of the 250 villages and farms in which an estimated 150,000 Syrians lived in 1967, all but five villages have been levelled, and an estimated population of only 17,000 to 25,000 Syrians remain in the Golan Heights. There are no available figures on the number of displaced remaining within the Golan Heights. Currently over 430,000 displaced Syrians are located in southern and central Syria, while over 14 Israeli settlements, illegal under international law, and military zones control at least 90 per cent of the Golan Heights.

13. In the OPT, forced displacement is a recurring and pervasive phenomenon. This has paralleled Israel policies of occupation that have made close to 40 per cent of the West Bank, including East Jerusalem, significantly or totally inaccessible to Palestinians. In these areas there are over 140 Israeli settlements and 100 outposts, military infrastructure and firing zones, Israeli-designated nature reserves and “closed areas” or “seam zones” between the Separation Wall and the armistice line of 1948, otherwise known as the Green Line). In the Gaza Strip, Israel controlled 24 per cent of the territory until the withdrawal of Israeli settlements in 2005.
14. In the OPT, more than 110,000 people are estimated to have been displaced during the last four decades. Forced displacement has been manifested as result of: house demolitions, evictions and land appropriation; settlements and settler violence, construction of the Separation Wall, and repeated Israeli incursions and military operations. The construction of the Wall, declared illegal by the International Court of Justice, had displaced over 14,000 Palestinians by 2005, while its continued construction and associated restrictive permit regime is placing between 50,000 to 90,000 people at risk of displacement.

15. In addition, in Area C of the West Bank and in East Jerusalem, thousands of Palestinian homes have been destroyed for lack of Israeli permit requirements in a manner which discriminates against Palestinians. From 2003 to 2006 alone, over 300 houses, including multi-storey buildings, were demolished in East Jerusalem. In Area C, between 2000 to 2007, over 1,600 Palestinian homes were demolished while over 3,000 houses are in 2008 at risk of demolition. There is also clear evidence of indirect displacement through effects of the “closure regime” – elaborate restrictions in freedom of movement witnessed in the West Bank – which has made situations for residents within Palestinian enclaves untenable, leading to displacement.

16. The reported failure of Israeli military interventions (principally in Gaza) to adhere to humanitarian law (due to disproportionate use of force and non-adherence to the principle of distinction) has resulted in the displacement of thousands. Successive Israeli incursions since 2006 in Gaza have resulted in damage and destruction of over one thousand homes, and caused the displacement of over 5,100 Palestinian civilians. More recently, in February 2008, several hundred Palestinians were temporarily displaced and the homes of close to 800 persons were damaged and scores destroyed. Many Palestinians also remain displaced as reconstruction efforts have been frozen due to sanctions levied against Gaza.

IV. Situation of Displaced Communities in Israel and Arab Occupied Territories

- Principle of equality and non-discrimination;
- Right to an adequate standard of living;
- Right to health;
- Right to education;
- Right to work;
- Obligations for humanitarian access;
- Freedom of movement, and residence;
- Protection of home.

17. Forced displacement has had a significant negative impact on peoples’ enjoyment of basic rights and their standard of living. Though this is true of all communities including Jewish Israelis, communities of Palestinian or Syrian origin have endured disproportionately severe and lasting displacement. This situation has been aggravated by discriminatory policies and regulations that have affected Palestinians, Palestinian Israelis and Syrians. Land, resources such as water, building rights and right to adequate housing, and laws governing family reunification discriminate against Palestinians, as well as Syrians in the Golan Heights. Severe restrictions on freedom of movement and demolitions of houses discriminately affect Palestinians and Palestinian Israelis.

18. Communities displaced or at risk of displacement have limited opportunity to seek redress from Israeli policies or actions. Israel does not provide assistance or protection to Palestinians, or Syrians displaced. Legal mechanisms, established by Israel’s military administration in the OPT, and in occupied East Jerusalem and Israel under Israeli civil law, have often failed to provide effective remedies for displacement, while compensation is only rarely provided, and fraught with limitations due to lengthy procedures and requirements. For displaced people in OPT and Golan Heights, and for Palestinian Israelis including Bedouin, questions of return, restitution of property and adequate compensation for lost or destroyed property remain unresolved.

19. The diversity of displacement that affects urban as well as rural communities, reveals a wide array of differing needs and human rights affected. Thousands have had their homes demolished for non adherence to planning regulations, and been unable to retrieve possessions, compelled to seek housing elsewhere or make makeshift shelters for fear of losing rights over their land. Others such as Bedouin communities in the Jordan Valley in OPT, or in Negev in Israel, have faced multiple displacements.
and their traditional rights remain unrecognised. Tens of thousands have been compelled to flee in fear of their lives and to seek temporary shelter in schools, public buildings or within host community until such hostility ends. Displacement also has entailed loss of family unity, social welfare and livelihoods, with lands and property no longer accessible. It has also entailed wide-ranging physical and psychological impacts, including trauma and anxiety for children and adults as well as lack of access to health, clean water, and education.

20. This situation of forced displacement in the OPT is amplified by the existing humanitarian and socio-economic situation and aggravated by intermittent cycles of violence, which underlines the precarity and protection needs of the Palestinian community as a whole. The phenomena of displacement cannot be disassociated from the fragmentation of the OPT as a result of land appropriation, continuing restrictions in access and movements and development of two tier infrastructure which benefits Israeli settlers. Palestinian freedom of movement in the OPT is in practice restricted by a combination of physical obstacles and permit restrictions. In contrast, Israeli settlers benefit from extensive infrastructure wherein many major roads are exclusively for Jewish settlers. A network of 1,661 kilometres of roads for Israeli use only connects settlements, outposts, military bases, national parks and closed military areas. Such restrictive measures beyond acceptable limitations in law and discriminatory nature have been widely condemned by the international community.

21. The humanitarian situation in the OPT has sharply deteriorated over the last four years affecting all Palestinians, whether displaced or not. For many international observers, Israel’s restrictions in movements are the primary cause of poverty and crisis. In late 2007, 58 per cent of Palestinians in the OPT – or 2.3 million – lived below the poverty line, while nearly fifty per cent of Palestinian households are dependent on food assistance provided by the international community with 80 per cent of households in Gaza. Infrastructure in Gaza remains precarious with basic services such as hospitals, water and sewerage systems significantly affected by lack of electricity and fuel due to Israel’s sanctions.

22 Access to populations in need by the humanitarian community, including the United Nations, has seen increased restrictions imposed by Israel with drastic humanitarian consequences. Israeli actions have included restrictions of movement, imposition of special access permits as well as arrest and detention of national humanitarian staff while national organisations, including charities have been subject to raids, confiscation of materials and closures. Israel’s denial of humanitarian access has also included denial of emergency and regular medical assistance, and blocking of the delivery of medicines, food and water during hostilities, as well curtailing civilian access to medical services. This also includes the total isolation of Gaza by Israel since June 2007 until June 2008 in response to Palestinian militant attacks which has brought the whole civilian population on the verge of a humanitarian crisis, and has been widely condemned as amounting to collective punishment. Between June last year and January 2008, there has been a 70 per cent reduction in the supply lines into Gaza.

V. IDMC’s Recommendations

At the third session of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, the IDMC invites the Human Rights Council to consider the following recommendations to the State of Israel:

- Recognise the de jure and de facto applicability of the Fourth Geneva Convention and international human rights law to the Occupied Palestinian Territory and the Occupied Syrian Golan Heights and distinguish in all circumstances between military objectives and civilian persons and objects;
- Ensure the protection of civilians from arbitrary displacement and other human rights violations in line with international human rights standards and international humanitarian law in Occupied Arab territories and Israel.
- Cease the Occupation of the Golan Heights and Palestinian Territory.
• End the policy of confiscating Palestinian land; and dismantle Jewish settlements in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, which are contrary to international law and which threaten the contiguity of Palestinian lands;
• Restore freedom of movement for Palestinians throughout the Occupied Palestinian Territory by lifting closures including the isolation of Gaza, and end roads only to Israeli settlers and preventing access by Palestinians;
• Cease building the Separation Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, and comply fully with the provisions of the advisory opinion of the International Court of Justice and all provisions of General Assembly resolution ES-10/15;
• Impose moratorium on all Bedouin home and Palestinian Israeli home demolitions until appropriate measures have been taken to ensure that the rights and interests of Bedouin and Palestinian Israeli citizens’ have been fully respected and protected in future implementation of planning and development policy.
• Enact legislation that provides the greatest possible security of tenure to residents of houses and land, and ensures that any evictions are carried out in a non-discriminatory way and in accordance with international human rights norms.

The information above is drawn from the following sources, where it is fully referenced:

- the following country profiles in the IDMC’s online database including Israel, Occupied Palestinian Territory and Syria.

This information, and more, is accessible at http://www.internal-displacement.org/countries/

---

1 Estimates of the total IDP population in Israel and Arab Occupied Territories are controversial, and vary according to sources, existing data and applicable definition. No specific agency is mandated to address internal displacement within Israel or the Occupied Arab Territories, nor has there been any registration undertaken of victims of forced displacement.

2 Internally displaced people are described in the UN Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement as “persons or groups of persons who have been forced or obliged to flee or to leave their homes or places of habitual residence, in particular as a result of or to avoid the effects of armed conflict, situations of generalized violence, violations of human rights or natural or human-made disasters, and who have not crossed an internationally recognized state border.” References to forced displacement in this submission also includes secondary displaced refugees, referring to refugees who have been victims of displacement within the Occupied Palestinian Territory (OPT). Lack of registration renders it very difficult to distinguish between secondary displaced refugees and internally displaced when discussing the question of displacement in the OPT.

3 UDHR Article 2 and ICERD Article 1.1 as well as other non-discrimination provisions such as ICCPR Article 2.1, ICESCR Article 2.2

4 UDHR Article 25.1 and ICESCR Article 11.1 as well as its impact on Articles 12, 13, and 6

5 UDHR Article 25.1 and ICESCR Article 12

6 UDHR Article 26.1 and ICESCR Article 13

7 UDHR Article 23 and ICESCR Article 6 as well as Articles 7 and 9

8 UDHR Article 13 and ICCPR Article 12

9 UDHR Article 12 and ICCPR Article 17


11 Uprooted Citizens, Arab Association for Human Rights (ARABHRA), 7 May 2008


13 Land and Housing Rights Violations in Israel’s Unrecognized Bedouin Villages, Human Rights Watch (HRW), March 2008


16 Land and Housing Rights Violations in Israel’s Unrecognized Bedouin Villages, Human Rights Watch (HRW), March 2008
December 2006
Mission to Lebanon and Israel (7-14 September 2006) United Nations General Assembly (UN GA), 2 October 2006; ADALAH’s report to the UN CERD in response to the list of issues presented to Israel, Adalah (Legal Center for Arab Minority Rights in Israel), February 2007.

Regional Information Networks (IRIN), 27 January 2008

State won’t relieve mortgage of Sderot’s ‘house hostages’, Ha’aretz, 11 February 2008
Reinforcement for Sderot schools won’t be ready by September, Ha’aretz, 12 June 2007,
Ten months after govt. decision, Sderot schools remain unprotected, Ha’aretz, 7 July 2008

IV Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Times of War, and Common Article 3 of the Geneva Conventions of 1949 as well as a number of customary rules of International Humanitarian Law, in particular those related to displacement and displaced persons, e.g. Rule 129B, 131, 132, 134, 135; (Rules as defined by the Study on Customary International Humanitarian Law, International Review of the Red Cross, Volume 87, Number 857, March 2005)

The principle of distinction refers to the obligation of parties to a conflict to distinguish between civilians and combatants and direct their attacks only against members of armed forces and other persons directly participating in hostilities, but never against civilians who do not. This fundamental rule is not only enshrined in Articles 48-51 Protocol I and Article 13 Protocol II but is also part of customary international humanitarian law applicable to international and non-international armed conflicts (ICRC Study, Rules 1, 5 and 6)

UDHR Article 2 and ICERD Article 1.1 as well as other non-discrimination provisions such as ICCPR Article 2.1, ICESCR Article 2.2

ICPR Article 1
UDHR Article 25.1 and ICESCR Article 11.1 as well as its impact on Articles 12, 13, and 6
UDHR Article 13 and ICCPR Article 12
UDHR Article 25.1 and ICESCR Article 12
UDHR Article 26.1 and ICESCR Article 13
UDHR Article 23 and ICESCR Article 6 as well as Articles 7 and 9
According to international custom, parties to the conflict must allow and facilitate rapid and unimpeded passage of impartial humanitarian relief, i.e. Rule 55, and humanitarian relief personnel and objects must be respected and protected, i.e. Rules 31 and 32 (Rules as defined by the Study on Customary International Humanitarian Law, International Review of the Red Cross, Volume 87, Number 857, March 2005)

The Humanitarian Impact on Palestinians of Israeli Settlements and Other Infrastructure, UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (UN OCHA), July 2007


No Place Like Home: House Demolitions in East Jerusalem, Israeli Committee Against House Demolitions, March 2007

“Lack of Permit” Demolitions and Resultant Displacement in Area C, UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (UN OCHA), May 2008

OPT: Refugees displaced by military offensive. Integrated Regional Information Networks (IRIN), 7 September 2006; Beit Hanoun Flash Appeal, United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (UNRWA), 19 November 2006; OCHA Humanitarian Update: Access and Protection, UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (UN OCHA), 31 July 2006

The Humanitarian Monitor March 2008, UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (UN OCHA), 18 April 2008

UDHR Article 2 and ICERD Article 1.1 as well as other non-discrimination provisions such as ICCPR Article 2.1, ICESCR Article 2.2
UDHR Article 25.1 and ICESCR Article 11.1 as well as its impact on Articles 12, 13, and 6
UDHR Article 25.1 and ICESCR Article 12
UDHR Article 26.1 and ICESCR Article 13
UDHR Article 23 and ICESCR Article 6 as well as Articles 7 and 9
According to international custom, parties to the conflict must allow and facilitate rapid and unimpeded passage of impartial humanitarian relief, i.e. Rule 55, and humanitarian relief personnel and objects must be respected and protected, i.e. Rules 31 and 32 (Rules as defined by the Study on Customary International Humanitarian Law, International Review of the Red Cross, Volume 87, Number 857, March 2005)
UDHR Article 13 and ICCPR Article 12

ADALAH’s report to the UN CERD in response to the list of issues presented to Israel, Adalah (Legal Center for Arab Minority Rights in Israel), February 2007. Discussions with NGO Activists in West Bank, IDMC, February 2008.

Lack of Permit Demolitions and Resultant Displacement in Area C, UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (UN OCHA), May 2008; No Place Like Home: House Demolitions in East Jerusalem, Israeli Committee Against House Demolitions, March 2007

No Place Like Home: House Demolitions in East Jerusalem, Israeli Committee Against House Demolitions, March 2007

Since 2000 the conflict would take the lives of 5340 Palestinians, 1122 Israelis, and over 30,000 injured. Statistics on Fatalities, B’Tselem, May, 2008


Gaza Humanitarian Situation Report: Impact of Fuel Shortages on Gaza Situation, UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (UN OCHA), 29 April 2008

The Humanitarian Monitor: Occupied Palestinian Territory April 2008, UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (UN OCHA), May 2008; Rocket attacks from Gaza hampering aid deliveries, Israel says, Integrated Regional Information Networks (IRIN), 13 September 2007

OPT: Humanitarian Update (Special Focus: Access to Jerusalem – New Military Order Limits West Bank Palestinian Access), UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (UN OCHA), 28 February 2006; UN facing increased delays at Israeli checkpoints, Integrated Regional Information Networks (IRIN), 30 April 2008